

# Student Role: Animal Rights Activist

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

**(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all activists.)**

As a "keystone" or top predator, mountain lions play a crucial role in the ecosystems of Arizona. If we cannot protect the mountain lion, we are sentencing the rest of our environment to certain death.

Developers have chosen to build homes in mountain lion habitat. As a result, we push the mountain lion and other wildlife species into smaller and smaller areas. What do we expect the animals to do? They need to survive as well. If we want to solve this problem, we need to keep people from using these areas, whether to live or to play. Maybe if we increased the taxes or fees for those people who insist on using prime mountain lion habitat, we could force them to reconsider their choices. But that is an issue that can only be dealt with by the legislature. The Arizona Game and Fish Department is correct in not taking any action.

Leave the lions alone! You chose to live near wildlife. You cannot pick "nice" animals over "mean" ones. You get both. If you have a problem, you should not have moved there in the first place.

## Student Role: Concerned Parent

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all parents.)***

I should not be afraid to live in my own house, but right now, I am. Just the other day, I was out in my yard with my 4-year-old daughter for quite a while, when suddenly I looked over and saw a mountain lion hiding in the trees not more than 10 feet from my daughter. It was clear to me that had I not been there, my daughter would have been attacked. Luckily, we were able to get inside. But what about the next time? Who knows how long it had been there or how long it would have stayed? And what about the school? If it took me that long to notice it in my own yard, how long will it take to notice in a schoolyard?

To make matters worse, when I reported the incident, I was told that it most likely was a bobcat and not a mountain lion. As if I am not intelligent enough to tell the difference between the two. This isn't rocket science!

If a mountain lion comes into an urban area, it needs to be removed by any means necessary—no exceptions! Otherwise, people will be harmed.

## Student Role: Concerned Taxpayer

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

**(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all taxpayers.)**

I could not be happier with the actions of the Arizona Game and Fish Department. Do you really think that the Florida government would kill all of the alligators if one attacks a person? No. It would cost too much. The same is true of lions in Arizona.

I do not believe that we, as taxpayers, should have to pay for the control of these animals that affect a very small percentage of the total population. These people chose to live where wildlife would become an issue. If they have a problem with the animals, they should be responsible for taking care of it. If you want the mountain lion to be controlled, then you had better find a way to pay for it. It may not seem like a lot of money right now, but when you consider the fact that so many more people are buying houses in the "wilderness," you can see that it will add up quickly.

Do not spend my money to deal with your problem!

# Student Role: Federal Government Employee

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

**(Note – This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all federal employees.)**

I hesitate to support any change regarding the management of mountain lions at this time. It is not the role of the federal government to manage wildlife in the states. That role is best left to the state wildlife agencies.

State wildlife biologists have a better understanding of the environmental conditions and population status of the mountain lion within their state. Therefore, they are in the better position to make management decisions relative to mountain lions within Arizona.

Nonetheless, the federal government also shares an interest in providing public safety for people using their public lands. We need to have accurate data in order to make decisions. Otherwise, many resources, including significant time and money, would be wasted with management protocols or policies that would not have the desired effect or that would not withstand scrutiny by stakeholders.

# Student Role: Game and Fish Employee

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all department employees.)***

The Arizona Game and Fish Department has invested a lot of time and money in researching the best ways to manage the wildlife of our great state. By all accounts, we are the experts in the field. The policies we have created are based on scientific evidence that addresses both the concerns of the public and the animals. We need to give ourselves more credit and stop being so sensitive to the opinions of a few people.

The department has prepared a protocol for dealing with mountain lions that is based on scientific and social data. It has been extensively reviewed by the public to take into consideration as many different perspectives as possible.

The mountain lions have shown no sign of aggression toward humans. Consequently, there is no reason why we should remove any at this time. We will continue to monitor the situation. If there ever should be a substantial threat to public safety, we will remove the lions at that time.



## Student Role: Governor's Aide

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all governor's aides)***

Since it is a government agency, the Arizona Game and Fish Department is required to make an informed decision that will benefit all of the people of Arizona. As a result, it is important that we do not rush to conclusions about the correct management of the mountain lions.

I believe that we should look at all sides of the issues, weigh the facts, and make a decision with which all of our citizens can agree. If someone disagrees, then his or her voice needs to be heard to see if we can find a way to reach a compromise.

This may mean that the department's protocol is right. Or it may mean that it needs to be modified to allow for the relocation of these animals. It may mean that the mountain lions need to be removed for the safety of the people. Or it may be some combination of these choices. I am confident that this town council meeting will provide us with the facts and viewpoints required to determine a proper course of action for the department.

# Student Role: Head of National Wildlife Organization

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all wildlife organizations.)***

Just as the Arizona Game and Fish Department is not responsible if a coyote eats your cat, they should not be held responsible for the actions of a few stray mountain lions. The department should be able to monitor mountain lions, as their protocol clearly outlines, and take action only if they become a substantial threat to human beings.

We need to be careful, however, how we categorize this threat. Human responses to the same situation can vary dramatically from person to person. We cannot rely on the word of one person, especially if that person has no wildlife experience. We should choose to remove an animal only when the decision can be backed up with scientific data. If removal is necessary, we should consider alternatives to killing the animal, such as relocation.

Finally, we need to develop some good legislation. Home developers should be required to inform potential buyers of these risks, and buyers should be held responsible for their decisions. In addition, we need to implement harsh fines for people who feed wildlife, such as deer and rabbits, that might attract lions.

## Student Role: Houndsman

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

**(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all houndsmen.)**

Arizona is not the first state to deal with mountain lions, and it won't be the last. As our population continues to increase, the situation will only get worse. We have a unique opportunity to become the standard that all other states look to when dealing with similar situations.

The Arizona Game and Fish Department should look into the idea of "adverse conditioning." We know that mountain lions do not like dogs. When a lion encounters one, the lion will run up a tree where it becomes easy to catch. Whenever a mountain lion is seen, houndsmen should be permitted to track the lion and force it into a tree. At that time, department employees can be sent in to capture the animal and release it in a safer area. If the employees also fire "blank" bullets, the lions will develop a fear of humans and learn to stay away from urban areas.

This strategy would not only protect humans, it would also provide a safe alternative to killing the animal and promote an activity that would bring many tourists into the state. It is truly a win-win situation.



# Student Role: Housing Developer

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all housing developers.)***

People love their houses. It is the biggest investment that they make with their money, and they want the best value for that money. As a result, they look for the biggest house, with the biggest lot, with the best view for the cheapest amount of money. Most often, that means that we must build new homes in new areas. We know that the houses we build now are right in the middle of wildlife habitat. We even cut down some of the trees to make room. But that is what people want.

At the same time, the people do want to feel safe and secure in their homes. They love to look outside and see the natural world. It means they are away from the problems that big cities bring — crime, drugs, etc. But it also means they have the potential for problems with mountain lions.

The more publicity this issue brings, the worse it is for business. If people are attacked by mountain lions in their yards or the neighborhood park, others are less likely to buy in similar areas. However, if people see mountain lions being shot and killed right next to houses, they fear a loss of property values. It is clear that we need more information before we support a decision.

## Student Role: Hunter

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all hunters.)***

For many parts of Arizona, the best solution is to increase the hunting of mountain lions by allowing off-season hunts. Legal hunting, however, is not very practical in or around urban areas. Instead, we should open these areas up to archery-only hunting. It could even require a special hunting license. I believe I can speak for all recreational hunters in saying that we would be more than happy to help balance the mountain lion population.

Increasing the hunting opportunities is a great solution that would benefit everyone. Sales of special licenses would provide the department with more money to manage the wildlife in Arizona, recreational hunters would have additional opportunities, and the risk to everyday citizens created by mountain lions would be virtually eliminated. In addition, since the department would control the hunt, it could manage the lion population by appropriately managing the number of licenses offered.

Recreational hunters should be considered a resource for these types of animal removal situations.

# Student Role: Insurance Agent

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all insurance agents.)***

The Arizona Game and Fish Department needs to take more aggressive action with regard to the mountain lion situation. If not, people will be harmed, and those people will take action against the department and the State of Arizona. Liability issues regarding the mountain lion will keep the department from doing its job and managing the other wildlife in the state — unless they deal with the mountain lions now.

With regard to citizens, there is no such thing as “personal liability.” When the risk is very high, it is a public responsibility to try to alleviate it. There are only two ways to eliminate the risk posed by mountain lions: kill the lions or prevent the people from encountering them by closing off areas inhabited by them. With our growing population, the second choice is not very practical. As a result, the mountain lions must be removed from urban areas.

If action is not taken, it could cost the State of Arizona millions of dollars in legal fees and the citizens thousands in increased insurance premiums.

## Student Role: Local School Teacher

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all teachers.)***

As a first grade teacher, I can tell you that animals play a very important role in the emotional development of young children. I often use animals as a way to spark the interest of my students. By using animals, I can get my students to write sentences and share ideas in ways they have never done before. In addition, taking care of their pets at home and in class often helps children to build a sense of responsibility.

I am afraid that if we begin a major campaign to eliminate mountain lions, we may emotionally scar the youth of Arizona. Imagine a child sitting at home watching television. Suddenly, the local news comes on and shows horrific scenes of dead mountain lions, creatures that look remarkably similar to their own cats. There is no way that we will ever know the true cost of these actions.

To make matters worse, I happen to teach at a school whose mascot is the cougar. And there are many other schools like mine. How are we supposed to tell our students that the Arizona government is killing our mascot on purpose? What can we say that will help them understand?

My students are asking the Arizona Game and Fish Department to leave the cougars alone.

## Student Role: News Media

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all members of the news media)***

It is clear that the people of Arizona are concerned about the issue of mountain lions. Over the past year, nearly 100 reports of mountain lion sightings have been called in to our station. The vast majority of our viewers have expressed fear and concern about mountain lions close to their neighborhoods.

It is clear that the people have a fascination with wildlife and the possible dangers they present. If the Arizona Game and Fish Department does not take any action, the likelihood of an attack increases. With a school nearby, we feel we have the responsibility to inform the viewing public of this potentially dangerous situation.

We don't make the news; we just report it. Unfortunately, we never know how people will respond.



# Student Role: Outdoor Recreationist

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all outdoor recreationists.)***

As a person who spends a lot of time in the outdoors, I am very pleased to see that the Arizona Game and Fish Department has chosen to take no action at this time. There is nothing like hiking in the mountains or camping in the woods and seeing animals in their natural environment. I cannot wait for the time when my children are old enough to experience wildlife first hand.

I still remember the first and only time I saw a mountain lion in the wild, nearly five years ago. At no time was I scared. In fact, my only reaction was, "Wow, how cool is this?"

We need to find ways to live with the animals without harming them. They are a valuable resource that makes Arizona a very special place to live. It is not the animals that are dangerous; it is the behavior of the people when they encounter the animals that is dangerous. We need to work actively on educating the citizens of Arizona about how their actions affect not only the environment, but also the animals that live there.

# Student Role: Rancher #1

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all ranchers.)***

I love the outdoors. In fact, that was one of the reasons why I became a rancher in the first place. I want nothing more than for my children to be able to experience the wilds of Arizona in as natural a state as possible.

Speaking from personal experience, I know that the mountain lion will kill livestock. I have lost a number of my cattle because of mountain lion attacks. Since my income is dependent on the number of healthy cattle I have, these deaths have a dramatic impact on my family and me.

However, I have seen some of the science. I know that the lions are an important part of the ecosystem. Without them, we may have a whole bunch of other problems, including overpopulation of elk and deer, which graze the same grasses that my cattle do.

I would love to support the preservation of the mountain lion, but I need more information. I want to be assured that these mountain lions will not become a threat to my family's safety and livelihood. I will do what I can to help as long as I see that the overall result will be beneficial to everyone involved.

## Student Role: Rancher #2

### The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

### Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all ranchers.)***

Large predators like the mountain lion will always be a threat to humans. Our country had it right a hundred years ago when we vigorously hunted them. They are killers. Everything about them says kill without mercy — their sharp teeth and claws, their stalking behavior, their beady eyes. It is their instinct to kill, and they will not make an exception of humans.

I have many fellow ranchers who have seen these killers in action. One in particular told me of an instance in which his sheep were going to get water from a pond on his property. A mountain lion hid and ambushed them. The sheep didn't have a chance. As the drought continues, we can only expect many more repeats of this situation all over the state.

Ranching is my livelihood. I should not have to worry about my cattle on my property. This type of risk would not be tolerated in any other type of job. If the lions are close to humans, they should be eliminated, either through legal hunting or predator management. If the Arizona Game and Fish Department will not do it, we will do it ourselves.

# Student Role: School Board Member

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

***(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all school board members.)***

Mountain lions will kill people. Many people in California, many of whom were children, have lost their lives recently because of these creatures. It is bound to happen here as well, unless we take preventative measures now.

As a member of the local school board, I am greatly concerned about this mountain lion situation. The sighting of a mountain lion near one of our schools has already created panic. Many parents are calling and demanding that something be done or they will remove their children from the school. How can we protect our students and provide a safe learning environment if a mountain lion is close to the school? And what if an attack does happen? Right now, there is nothing that I, as a board member, can say to reassure parents that their children will be safe. That's not right.

We need to look after our children. We cannot let them become the food of choice.

# Student Role: University Wildlife Biologist

## The Problem

Homeowners have observed at least one mountain lion in a subdivision that borders U.S. Forest Service land and near an elementary school. No attacks on humans have occurred yet. In fact, no one has seen any aggressive behavior toward humans. However, a report confirms that a mountain lion has killed at least one dog recently. The Arizona Game and Fish Department, responsible for managing the wildlife of the state, has a protocol that details how situations like these are handled. It reads:

*Mountain lions will be destroyed if they attack a human or when they are judged to be a substantial threat to public safety. However, dogs, cats, and other small domestic pets could be considered a natural prey base for lions. The loss of these pets from lions will not be a sufficient reason to remove a lion from its home range. The agency has considered trapping and relocating problem lions; however, due to their large home ranges, the fact that all suitable habitat is occupied; and intraspecific defense of occupied habitat, this option will not be used.*

Based on this protocol, the department has decided to take no immediate action. Some concerned citizens are questioning this policy and are asking the governor to require the agency to take action. Before making a decision, the governor has requested that a special town council meeting be held with various stakeholders and the department.

You have been assigned a particular role, and you will attend the town council meeting in that role. As a result, you must become familiar with the role. Read the information below to get an idea of the basic beliefs of your stakeholder. After reading, complete Table 1 on the *Position Analysis Worksheet*. Use the definitions and questions on the worksheet to help you complete the table. In addition, you may research your role on the Internet to get more ideas before you meet with the other stakeholders.

## Your Viewpoint

**(Note - This is the opinion of one person and does not necessarily represent all wildlife biologists.)**

At this time, we lack appropriate data to allow us to make decisions regarding the management of mountain lions in Arizona. We do not have an accurate count of the mountain lion population. Therefore, we do not know if the population is increasing, decreasing, or remaining stable. We only know that the human population is increasing. As a result, we cannot say that we are seeing an increase in human and mountain lion encounters because the lion is losing its fear of humans or simply because there is less room for all of us now. We do know that most reported mountain lion sightings are inaccurate. It turns out that the people saw some other animal but did not have enough experience to identify it correctly. Of course, that does not mean we should discount those sightings that prove accurate.

Many studies give us information about mountain lions in a particular region. But we must hesitate to apply that information to the general population of lions. Regional characteristics that we are unaware of could account for differences in the behavior of lions.

I need more information before I am ready to decide this issue.



## Stakeholder Analysis Chart, page 1

<b>ROLE</b>	<b>POSITION</b>	<b>INTEREST</b>	<b>BELIEFS</b>	<b>VALUES</b>
Animal Rights Activist				
Outdoor Recreationist				
Game and Fish Employee				
Head of National Wildlife Organization				
Local School Teacher				
Concerned Taxpayer				
University Wildlife Biologist				
Federal Government Employee				
Governor's Aide				
News Media				

*Portions of this worksheet are © Arizona Science Center and are used with permission.*

## Stakeholder Analysis Chart, page 2

ROLE	POSITION	INTEREST	BELIEFS	VALUES
Housing Developer				
Insurance Agent				
Hunter				
Houndsman				
School Board Member				
Concerned Parent				
Rancher #1				
Rancher #2				

*Portions of this worksheet are © Arizona Science Center and are used with permission.*

# Position Analysis Worksheet

Answer the following questions to help you complete Table 1. Remember, you must answer the questions in the role that you have been assigned. As a result, some of the answers may not align with your personal opinions. Put yourself in this person's shoes.

**Position:** Your specific viewpoint about the issue and what action, if any, should be taken.

1. Do you think that the Arizona Game and Fish Department should continue with its current course of action or make changes?
2. What action do you think should be taken?

**Interest:** An immediate underlying concern applied to this specific issue that reflects your values and beliefs, and addresses why this issue is important to you.

1. Why do you care whether the Arizona Game and Fish Department continues with its current course of action?
2. What immediate concerns do you have regarding the department's policy?

**Beliefs:** Those ideas, whether true or not, that you hold regarding this issue.

1. What ideas or opinions do you have concerning the Arizona Game and Fish Department's position?

**Values:** Personal "guides" which tend to direct human behavior and reflect the relative importance of an individual's beliefs in a given situation. These are usually shaped by economic, social, cultural, educational, historical, legal, political, recreational, scientific, and spiritual beliefs and experiences.

1. What are your personal beliefs or "guides" that most strongly reflect the importance of this issue to you?

*Table 1: Beliefs Grid for Your Role*

Role	Position	Interest	Beliefs	Values

Questions to help you plan for the town council meeting:

1. What is your initial position?
2. What reasons do you have for this position?
3. What is the most important concern that you have?
4. What other stakeholders might agree with your position? Why?
5. What other stakeholders might disagree with your position? Why?
6. What strategies will you use to allow these people to see your viewpoint and possibly change their minds?
7. Which stakeholders have not yet taken a definite stand on the issue?
8. What strategies will you use to convince these people to support your position?



*Portions of this worksheet are © Arizona Science Center and are used with permission.*

## Post-Meeting Worksheet

*Answer the following questions from your own viewpoint. You do not need to be in your stakeholder role any longer.*

1. Were you surprised with the outcome of the vote? Why or why not?
2. Do you agree with the position of the stakeholder that you played? Why or why not?
3. How well did the outcome serve the interests of all the stakeholders? Explain.
4. One purpose of this activity was to increase understanding of other people's values and beliefs. Do you think it was successful? Why or why not?
5. Management is based on science but is influenced by society. Prove this statement by giving examples from the activity.
6. How was this activity similar to situations that may occur in real life?
7. How was it different?

*Portions of this worksheet are © Arizona Science Center and are used with permission.*